

1 Brett L. Gibbs, Esq. (SBN 251000)
2 Of Counsel to Prenda Law Inc.
3 38 Miller Avenue, #263
Mill Valley, CA 94941
415-325-5900
blgibbs@wefightpiracy.com

4
Attorney for Plaintiff
5

6 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE
7 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

9 INGENUITY13 LLC,) **No. 2:12-cv-06662-ODW-JC**
10 Plaintiff,)
v.) **PLAINTIFF'S RESPONSE TO ORDER TO**
11) **SHOW CAUSE RE LACK OF SERVICE**
12 JOHN DOE,)
13 Defendant.)
14 _____)

15 **PLAINTIFF'S RESPONSE TO ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE RE LACK OF SERVICE**

16 On December 20, 2012, this Court issued its Order to Show Cause Re Lack of Service
17 in this case. (ECF No. 12). In that order, the Court pointed out that under the Federal Rule of
18 Civil Procedure 4(m), "defendant must be served within 120 days after the complaint is filed,
19 or else the Court 'must dismiss the action without prejudice.'" (*Id.*) Further, the Court
20 ordered that Plaintiff "has 7 days to comply with this order, or if Defendant have [sic] been
21 served, Plaintiff has 7 days to file the proof of service." (*Id.*) The Supreme Court, however,
22 has unambiguously held that "the 120-day provision operates not as an outer limit subject to
23 reduction, but as an irreducible allowance."¹ The Supreme Court also noted that "courts
24 have been accorded discretion to enlarge the 120-day period even if there is no good cause
25 shown."² Plaintiff nevertheless responds as follows. Plaintiff's delay in complying with the
26 irreducible allowance of FRCP 4(m) was caused by the fact that Plaintiff was attempting to
27

28 ¹ *Henderson v. United States*, 517 US 654, 661 (1996).

² *Id.* (Internal citations omitted).

1 contact the subscriber regarding the allegations of copyright infringement. Though the
2 subscriber, David Wagar, remained silent, Plaintiff's investigation of his household
3 established that Benjamin Wagar was the likely infringer of Plaintiff's copyright. As such,
4 Plaintiff mailed its Amended Complaint to the Court naming Benjamin Wagar as the
5 Defendant in this action.

6
7 Respectfully Submitted,

8 **DATED: December 27, 2012**

9 By: /s/ Brett L. Gibbs

10
11 Brett L. Gibbs, Esq. (SBN 251000)
12 Of Counsel to Prenda Law Inc.
13 38 Miller Avenue, #263
Mill Valley, CA 94941
blgibbs@wefightpiracy.com
Attorney for Plaintiff

14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28